

Regular Meeting

January 28, 2002
12:30 p.m.

A regular meeting of the Municipal Civil Service Commission convened on Monday, January 28, 2002, with Priscilla R. Tyson, Douglas S. Morgan and Grady L. Pettigrew present.

* * *

RE: *Review and approval of the December 17, 2001, regular meeting minutes.*

The minutes were approved as written.

* * *

RE: *Pre-hearing Conference Reviews.*

None submitted this month.

* * *

RE: *Rule Revisions.*

None submitted this month.

* * *

RE: *Trial Board Recommendations.*

None submitted this month.

* * *

RE: *Request of the Columbus Public Schools for permission to use the eligible list for Personnel Analyst II for the hiring of a Personnel Analyst I in accordance with Civil Service Rule IX – Certification.*

PRESENT: Reamus Martin, Acting Director Classified Personnel, Columbus Public Schools

Reamus Martin presented this request from the Columbus Public Schools because only five candidates were successfully recruited and examined for a Personnel Analyst I position. The duties for the Personnel Analyst I and Personnel Analyst II are very similar and it was determined that a Personnel Analyst I best fit their needs.

A motion to approve the request was made, seconded, and passed unanimously.

* * *

RE: *Request of the Civil Service Commission staff to revise the specification for the classification Custodial Supervisor (Class Code 3529).*

PRESENT: Tammy Rollins, Personnel Administrative Officer

Tammy Rollins presented the Commission's request to revise the specification for the classification Custodial Supervisor as part of the Commission's objective to review all classifications every five years. This classification was last reviewed in September of 1999.

The definition was revised to more accurately describe the supervisory duties and responsibilities assigned to and performed by incumbents of this classification. Changes to the examples of work were requested to more accurately reflect the duties and supervisory responsibilities performed by incumbents and to eliminate redundancies. No revision to the knowledge, skills and abilities, minimum qualifications, probationary period or examination type were recommended.

A motion to approve the request was made, seconded, and passed unanimously.

* * *

RE: *Request of the Civil Service Commission staff to revise the specification for the classification Maintenance Carpenter Supervisor I, retitle it to read Maintenance Carpenter Supervisor and amend Rule XI accordingly (Class Code 3516).*

PRESENT: Tammy Rollins, Personnel Administrative Officer

Tammy Rollins presented the Commission's request to revise the specification for the classification Maintenance Carpenter Supervisor I as part of the Commission's objective to review all classifications every five years. This classification was last reviewed in September of 1999.

The definition was revised to more accurately describe the supervisory duties and responsibilities assigned to and performed by incumbents of this classification. Changes to the examples of work were requested to more accurately reflect the duties and supervisory responsibilities performed by incumbents. It was requested that the guidelines for class use be deleted, as this description is inaccurate; incumbents of this classification currently function as working supervisors. It was requested that the minimum qualification be revised to require three years of carpentry experience to more accurately reflect the level of work performed by the incumbent and to maintain consistency within the progression of the series. No revision to the knowledge, skills and abilities, probationary period or examination type were recommended.

A motion to approve the request was made, seconded, and passed unanimously.

* * *

RE: *Request of the Civil Service Commission staff to revise the specification for the classification Police Commander (Class Code 3060).*

PRESENT: Jenny Mantilla, Personnel Analyst II

Jenny Mantilla presented the Commission's request to revise the specification for the classification Police Commander due to the recent ratification of a new contract that adds an educational requirement to the minimum qualifications section of the Police Commander specification. The contract specifically states the educational requirements for exams administered in the years 2002 through 2005, is sixty semester or 90 quarter hours of college credit and for exams administered in the year 2006 or later, a baccalaureate degree is required. In addition, one revision to the examples of work section was requested to revise the language from Legal Bureau to "Division's legal section. No other recommendations were requested.

A motion to approve the request was made, seconded, and passed unanimously.

* * *

RE: *Request of the Civil Service Commission staff to revise the specification for the classification Water Plant Operator I, change the probationary period to 365 days and amend Rule XI accordingly (Class Code 3881).*

This item was deferred.

* * *

RE: *Request of the Civil Service Commission staff to revise the specification for the classification Wastewater Plant Operator (Class Code 3873).*

PRESENT: William C. Terry, Personnel Analyst II

William C. Terry presented the Commission's request to revise the specification for the classification Wastewater Plant Operator as part of the ongoing effort to update all classifications at least every five years. This specification was last reviewed in November of 1993.

There were no recommended changes to the definition, probationary period or examination type. Revisions to the examples of work section were recommended to clarify the type of work incumbents perform. The minimum qualifications were revised to define the type of machinery with which applicants must have experience. It was recommended that the knowledge, skills and abilities be revised to indicate that Wastewater Plant Operators need only have the ability to exert fifty pounds of force, instead of one hundred pounds of force.

A motion to approve the request was made, seconded, and passed unanimously.

* * *

RE: *Request of the Civil Service Commission staff to revise the specification for the classification Maintenance Plumber (Class Code 3911).*

This item was deferred.

* * *

RE: *Request of the Civil Service Commission staff to revise the specification for the classification Traffic Sign Shop Supervisor, change the probationary period to 365 days and amend Rule XI accordingly (Class Code 4010).*

PRESENT: Tammy Rollins, Personnel Administrative Officer

Tammy Rollins presented the Commission's request to revise the specification for the classification Traffic Sign Shop Supervisor as part of the Commission's objective to review all classifications every five years. This classification was last reviewed in September of 1997. There is currently one incumbent serving in this classification in the Department of Public Service, Traffic Engineering Division.

The definition was revised to more accurately describe the work performed by this classification. The examples of work section was revised to describe in more detail the work performed by this classification. No revisions were proposed to the minimum qualifications section of the specification. The knowledge, skills, and abilities section was revised to include an ability to operate a personal computer and applicable software packages. It was recommended that the examination type remain competitive. It was also recommended that the probationary period be extended from 270 to 365 days to provide opportunity for management to assess an incumbents' skill and ability to perform the range of supervisory responsibilities, much of which may only occur once a year.

A motion to approve the request was made, seconded, and passed unanimously.

* * *

RE: *Request of the Civil Service Commission staff to revise the specification for the classification Sign Painter-Fabricator, change the probationary period to 270 days and amend Rule XI accordingly (Class Code 4013).*

This item was deferred.

* * *

RE: *Request of the Civil Service Commission staff to revise the specification for the classification Traffic Maintenance Worker, change the probationary period to 270 days and amend Rule XI accordingly (Class Code 4015).*

This item was deferred.

* * *

RE: *Request of the Civil Service Commission staff to revise the specification for the classification Traffic Paint and Sign Worker (Class Code 4016).*

PRESENT: Tammy Rollins, Personnel Administrative Officer

Tammy Rollins presented the Commission's request to revise the specification for the classification Traffic Paint and Sign Worker as part of the Commission's objective to review all classifications every five years. This classification was last reviewed in August of 1996.

No revisions to the definition were recommended. The examples of work section of the specification was revised to remove references to the hot line method of striping pavement and to replace this reference with the "thermoplastic" method of striping pavements. No revisions were recommended to the minimum qualifications, knowledge, skills and abilities, probationary period or examination type.

A motion to approve the request was made, seconded, and passed unanimously.

* * *

RE: *Request of the Civil Service Commission staff to revise the specification for the classification Traffic Maintenance Supervisor I (Class Code 4018).*

PRESENT: Tammy Rollins, Personnel Administrative Officer

Tammy Rollins, Personnel Administrative Officer, presented the Commission's request to revise the specification for the classification Traffic Maintenance Supervisor I as part of the Commission's objective to review all classifications every five years. This classification was last reviewed in June of 1995.

The definition was revised to reflect that this classification is a working supervisor. The examples of work and guidelines for class use sections were revised to reflect the work performed by these incumbents as working supervisors. No revisions were recommended to the minimum qualification, knowledge, skills and abilities, probationary period or examination type.

A motion to approve the request was made, seconded, and passed unanimously.

* * *

RE: *Request of the Civil Service Commission staff to revise the specification for the classification Golf Courses Maintenance Manager (Class Code 3714).*

PRESENT: Don White, Personnel Analyst Supervisor

Don White presented the Commission's request to revise the specification for the classification Golf Course Maintenance Manager as part of the Commission's objective to review all classifications every five years. This classification was last reviewed in October of 1996.

No revision to the definition was recommended. Based on the Commission staff request to retitle Golf Course Maintenance Supervisor to Golf Course Superintendent, one change to the examples of work was requested. No other revisions to this classification specification were requested.

A motion to approve the request was made, seconded, and passed unanimously.

* * *

RE: *Request of the Civil Service Commission staff to revise the specification for the classification Golf Course Maintenance Supervisor, retitle it to read Golf Course Superintendent and amend Rule XI accordingly (Class Code 3713).*

This item was deferred.

* * *

RE: *Residency hearing reviews.*

No residency hearing reviews were submitted this month.

* * *

RE: *Personnel actions.*

No personnel actions were submitted this month.

* * *

RE: *ADMINISTRATIVE/JURISDICTIONAL REVIEWS.*

Review of the appeal of Jawana Smith regarding the denial of her request to be reinstated to the police officer eligible list. Appeal No. 01-CA-0028.

The Commissioners upheld the written recommendation by Civil Service Commission staff to deny Ms. Smith's request to be reinstated to the police office eligible list and they dismissed her appeal without a hearing. Ms. Smith's resignation was effective June 23, 2000 and her request to be reinstated was received on November 27, 2001. Civil Service Commission Rule VIII(C)(1)(a) specifies that requests for reinstatement must be filed within one year from the date of separation from city employment.

Police Officer Applicants
Removed During The Prescreening Process
Dawna J. Grimes Traffic (E.5)
Sean W. Kirby Criminal Activity (G.1/G.2)

The Commissioners reviewed files for two police officer applicants for an administrative review of the decision of the Executive Director to reject their applications due to a violation of the background standards for police officers during the pre-screening process.

After reviewing the files of Dawna J. Grimes and Sean W. Kirby, the Commissioners decided their applications would not be accepted and they would not be permitted to take the police officer test.

* * *

The Commission adjourned its regular meeting at 1:12 p.m. to hear a disciplinary matter.

* * *

RE: *Hearing on the merits of the appeal of Sureeta D. Harris, from the action of the Department of Public Safety, Division of Police, suspending her for 120 hours from the position of Police Officer - Case No. 01-CA-0024.*

Commission President Tyson read the charges and specifications into the record.

- Charge I

You are hereby charged with violating Rule of Conduct 1.15 (A-6), which states, “Division personnel are to: Carry out such orders and directives as may be given them by superiors.”
- Specification I:

On or about October 19, 2000, you failed to obey a lawful order of a superior, to wit: When instructed by Acting Sergeant Dopp to turn in your City issued shoes, as required by Division Directive 3.19 (Section II, B, 1, b), you failed to do so.
- Specification II:

On or about October 23, 2000, you failed to obey a lawful order of a superior, to wit: When instructed by Acting Sergeant Dopp to turn in your City issued shoes, as required by Division Directive 3.19 (Section II, B, 1, b), you failed to do so.
- Specification III:

On or about October 24, 2000 at approximately 11:30 a.m., you failed to obey a lawful order of a superior, to wit: When ordered by Acting Sergeant Dopp to go home and bring your city issued shoes in before the end of the tour of duty, as required by Division Directive 3.19 (Section II, B, 1, b), you failed to do so.
- Specification IV:

On or about October 24, 2000 at approximately 2:55 p.m., you failed to obey a lawful order of a superior, to wit: When instructed by Lieutenant Timlin to turn in your City issued shoes the following day, as required by Division Directive 3.19 (Section II, B, 1, b), you failed to do so.
- Specification V:

On or about November 20, 2000, you failed to obey a lawful order of a superior, to wit: When advised by Acting Sergeant Dopp that you had not yet complied with his order to turn in your City issued shoes as required by Division Directive 3.19 (Section II, B, 1, b), you still failed to do so.
- Specification VI:

On or about October 19, 2000, you failed to obey a lawful order of a superior, to wit: When instructed by Acting Sergeant Dopp to complete an injury report with your special duty employer as required by Division 3.17 (Section III, A, 21), you failed to do so.
- Specification VII:

On or about October 26, 2000, you failed to obey a lawful order of a superior, to wit: When instructed in an e-mail by Acting Sergeant Dopp to complete an injury report with your special duty employer as required by Division 3.17 (Section III, A, 21), you failed to do so.

Appearances and preliminary matters were handled. Both parties agreed to a separation of witnesses. Commission President Tyson swore the witnesses en masse. Assistant City Attorney Matuska and Ronald Snyder, attorney for the appellant, gave opening statements.

Walter, Daily – Assistant City Attorney Matuska called Mr. Daily on direct examination. Mr. Daily was cross-examined by Mr. Snyder. The Commissioners questioned Mr. Daily and he was excused.

Darren Shaffer – Assistant City Attorney Matuska called Mr. Shaffer on direct examination. Mr. Matuska submitted City's Exhibit #1. Mr. Shaffer was cross-examined by Mr. Snyder, examined on re-direct by Mr. Matuska, answered questions from the Commissioners, was examined on re-cross by Mr. Snyder and was excused.

Debbie Crabtree – Assistant City Attorney Matuska called Ms. Crabtree on direct examination. Ms. Crabtree was cross-examined by Mr. Snyder and answered questions from the Commissioners. Ms. Crabtree was then excused.

Sally Blubaugh – Assistant City Attorney Matuska called Ms. Blubaugh on direct examination. Mr. Matuska submitted City's Exhibits #2, #3, #4 and #5. Ms. Blubaugh was cross-examined by Mr. Snyder and answered questions from the Commissioners. Mr. Snyder then called Ms. Blubaugh on direct examination as his witness and she was excused.

Sergeant Marc Dopp – Assistant City Attorney Matuska called Sergeant Dopp on direct examination. Mr. Matuska submitted City's Exhibits #6, #7 and #8. Sergeant Dopp was cross-examined by Mr. Snyder. Mr. Snyder submitted Appellant's Exhibits A and B. Sergeant Dopp was examined on re-direct by Mr. Matuska, answered questions from the Commissioners and was excused.

President Tyson recessed today's hearing and advised that the hearing will be continued at a later date.

* * *

The hearing was adjourned at 5:35 p.m.

* * *

Priscilla R. Tyson, Commission President

February 25, 2002

Date